



ISO/TC 197
Hydrogen technologies

Email of secretary: jim.ferrero@bnq.qc.ca
Secretariat: SCC (Canada)

For N doc Chair, TAB, Sec Evaluation 2015

Replaces: N 736

Document type: Summary of voting

Date of document: 2015-11-30

Expected action: INFO

Background: Here are the revised results of the Chair, TAB and Secretary evaluations that will be discussed at the Plenary under agenda item 6.1.

The only change from the previous summary (N 736) is that China's evaluation has been changed. There was a misunderstanding concerning the evaluation criteria.

Committee URL: <http://isotc.iso.org/livelink/livelink/open/tc197>

Result of voting

Ballot Information

Ballot reference	Evaluation of TC 197 Chair, TAB and Secretary
Ballot type	CIB
Ballot title	Performance evaluations of TC 197 Management
Opening date	2015-11-13
Closing date	2015-11-25
Note	<p>The Chair requested that we proceed with this evaluation, even though there is very little time for TC members to consult and respond. In any case, the subject will be discussed at at the upcoming plenary meeting.</p> <p>We are aware that there is still a need for improvements by the Secretary.</p>

Member responses:

Votes cast (20)	Argentina (IRAM) Brazil (ABNT) Canada (SCC) China (SAC) Czech Republic (UNMZ) Denmark (DS) Egypt (EOS) France (AFNOR) India (BIS) Italy (UNI) Japan (JISC) Korea, Republic of (KATS) Netherlands (NEN) New Zealand (SNZ) Norway (SN) Russian Federation (GOST R) Spain (AENOR) Sweden (SIS) United Kingdom (BSI) United States (ANSI)
Comments submitted (1)	Sri Lanka (SLSI)
Votes not cast (1)	Germany (DIN)

Questions:

Q.1	"Please rate the overall performance of the Chair of ISO/TC 197 on a scale of 1 to 5 (5 being the most satisfied and 1 being the least satisfied) or Abstain.
------------	---

	Andrei Tchouvelev has been the Chair of TC 197 since Sept. 2012. Note: The following attributes should be taken into consideration: openness and transparency, responsiveness, professionalism, sense of responsibility and accountability, management skills, overall climate/atmosphere within the TC that promotes international collaboration and teamwork. "
Q.2	"Please rate the performance of the Technical Advisory Board (TAB) of ISO/TC 197 on a scale of 1 to 5 (5 being the most satisfied and 1 being the least satisfied) or Abstain. Tab was approved at the TC meeting on Feb. 28, 2013. Note: The following attributes should be takes into consideration: the quality and usefulness of the TAB recommendations. "
Q.3	"Please rate the performance of the Secretary of ISO/TC 197 on a scale of 1 to 5 (5 being the most satisfied and 1 being the least satisfied) or Abstain. Jim Ferrero has been the Secretary of TC 197 since August 2012. Note: The following attributes should be taken into consideration: responsiveness, administrative skills, cooperativeness, knowledge of ISO Procedures and sense of responsibility."

Votes by members	Q.1	Q.2	Q.3
Argentina (IRAM)	5	4	4
Brazil (ABNT)	Abstain	Abstain	Abstain
Canada (SCC)	4	4	4
China (SAC)	1	3	2
Czech Republic (UNMZ)	Abstain	Abstain	Abstain
Denmark (DS)	Abstain	Abstain	Abstain
Egypt (EOS)	Abstain	Abstain	Abstain
France (AFNOR)	4	4	3
India (BIS)	4	4	4
Italy (UNI)	5	4	4
Japan (JISC)	5	4	4
Korea, Republic of (KATS)	5	5	5
Netherlands (NEN)	4	Abstain	4
New Zealand (SNZ)	Abstain	Abstain	Abstain
Norway (SN)	Abstain	Abstain	Abstain
Russian Federation (GOST R)	4	4	4
Spain (AENOR)	Abstain	Abstain	Abstain
Sweden (SIS)	Abstain	Abstain	Abstain
United Kingdom (BSI)	5	3	2
United States (ANSI)	4	4	3

Answers to Q.1: "Please rate the overall performance of the Chair of ISO/TC 197 on a scale of 1 to 5 (5 being the most satisfied and 1 being the least satisfied) or Abstain. Andrei Tchouvelev has been the Chair of TC 197 since Sept. 2012. Note: The following attributes should be taken into consideration: openness and transparency, responsiveness, professionalism, sense of responsibility and accountability, management skills, overall climate/atmosphere within the TC that promotes international collaboration and teamwork. "

1 x	1	China (SAC)
0 x	2	
0 x	3	
6 x	4	Canada (SCC) France (AFNOR) India (BIS) Netherlands (NEN) Russian Federation (GOST R) United States (ANSI)
5 x	5	Argentina (IRAM) Italy (UNI) Japan (JISC) Korea, Republic of (KATS) United Kingdom (BSI)
8 x	Abstain	Brazil (ABNT) Czech Republic (UNMZ) Denmark (DS) Egypt (EOS) New Zealand (SNZ) Norway (SN) Spain (AENOR) Sweden (SIS)

Answers to Q.2: "Please rate the performance of the Technical Advisory Board (TAB) of ISO/TC 197 on a scale of 1 to 5 (5 being the most satisfied and 1 being the least satisfied) or Abstain. Tab was approved at the TC meeting on Feb. 28, 2013. Note: The following attributes should be takes into consideration: the quality and usefulness of the TAB recommendations. "

0 x	1	
0 x	2	
2 x	3	China (SAC) United Kingdom (BSI)
8 x	4	Argentina (IRAM) Canada (SCC) France (AFNOR) India (BIS) Italy (UNI) Japan (JISC) Russian Federation (GOST R) United States (ANSI)
1 x	5	Korea, Republic of (KATS)

9 x	Abstain	Brazil (ABNT) Czech Republic (UNMZ) Denmark (DS) Egypt (EOS) Netherlands (NEN) New Zealand (SNZ) Norway (SN) Spain (AENOR) Sweden (SIS)
------------	----------------	--

Answers to Q.3: "Please rate the performance of the Secretary of ISO/TC 197 on a scale of 1 to 5 (5 being the most satisfied and 1 being the least satisfied) or Abstain. Jim Ferrero has been the Secretary of TC 197 since August 2012. Note: The following attributes should be taken into consideration: responsiveness, administrative skills, cooperativeness, knowledge of ISO Procedures and sense of responsibility."

0 x	1	
2 x	2	China (SAC) United Kingdom (BSI)
2 x	3	France (AFNOR) United States (ANSI)
7 x	4	Argentina (IRAM) Canada (SCC) India (BIS) Italy (UNI) Japan (JISC) Netherlands (NEN) Russian Federation (GOST R)
1 x	5	Korea, Republic of (KATS)
8 x	Abstain	Brazil (ABNT) Czech Republic (UNMZ) Denmark (DS) Egypt (EOS) New Zealand (SNZ) Norway (SN) Spain (AENOR) Sweden (SIS)

Comments from Voters		
Member:	Comment:	Date:
France (AFNOR)	<i>Comment</i>	2015-11-26 11:28:43
<p>We appreciate his ability in creating effective and relevant interactions between stakeholders, leading to a better visibility of ISO/TC 197 work and the enlargement of the representativeness of involved parties.</p> <p>Nonetheless, despite this remarkable and valuable impulse, the subsequent multiplication of parallel meetings complicates the follow-up of all the on-going activities.</p> <p>We appreciate TAB inputs as an appropriate support for the contextualization and the understanding of what the stakes are, and finally as a relevant support for decisions.</p>		

We appreciate his availability and reactivity whenever we contact him for information and recommendation.

United Kingdom (BSI)	Comment	2015-11-24 16:21:46
-----------------------------	----------------	------------------------

Dr Tchouvelev has shown strong, and fair leadership over any issues encountered, whilst looking to expand the projects taken on by ISO/TC 197 where appropriate. The UK is pleased to understand that Dr Tchouvelev's re-nomination was successful and that he will continue as ISO/TC 197 Chairman until December 2018.

The benefit of the TAB is made unclear by cross-over between roles of TPD (Technical Program Directors) and the Technical Advisory Board.

The involvement of TPD's in the working group is critical to help identify areas of concern early, and assist preparation of working group output with the confidence that ISO/TC 197 will be accepting of the content.

Concerns have been raised on occasions over the steering of the output of a working group towards the view of the TPD/TAB member, rather than necessarily following the consensus of the working group.

It is also concerning to see on occasions statements that refer to the TAB as regional representatives when regional consensus is not represented by a member of the TAB.

The minutes from the 2014 meetings of ISO/TC 197 had not been written and circulated at the time of the UK preparations for the 2015 plenary, but it is noted that these have since been prepared (which otherwise would have been completely unacceptable). It would be more useful to have these earlier in the year, in line with the already well established ISO timescales.

In addition, the ISO/TC 197 Secretary is to be reminded that all committee business should be conducted using N documents which have to be uploaded to ISO Livelink so that all Member Bodies can see them and traceability is ensured. It is not acceptable to carry out committee business by referring to documents that have not been circulated and uploaded to ISO Livelink as they have no traceability for Member Bodies and they cannot be accessed . If the present ISO Secretary were to change, traceability will be lost completely.

Support for the working group management however has been good, and is much appreciated.

United States (ANSI)	Comment	2015-11-25 16:28:27
-----------------------------	----------------	------------------------

We greatly appreciate the turn-around since the previous regime change. Andrei clearly works behind the scenes to resolve issues, but sometimes additional dialogue with stakeholders would be helpful before making decisions.

The TAB recommendations provide useful insight on NWIPs and other issues, but opportunity for dialogue in advance of recommendations would be helpful so that any concerns could be addressed.

Minutes from the 2014 plenary finally came out, 7 months later than promised. Responsiveness and sense of responsibility need improvement.

Comments from Commenters		
Member:	Comment:	Date:
Sri Lanka (SLSI)	Comment	2015-11-19 11:33:28
abstain		