

Compilation of comments on the ISO/TC 197 WG 9 proposed approach - Separation of the safety and performance requirements in Part 1 and 2 of the standard		ISO/TC 197 doc. N 287R2 Annex 2	
		Date:2004-06-23	Reference: ISO/TC 197 doc. N 276

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
AR				We agree with the priority of the Working Group 9 members and the recommended approach to develop a product safety standard first and a performance requirements standard in the next stage as a second part.	We agree with the following parts and titles: ISO 16610-1: Hydrogen generators using fuel processing technologies — Part 1: Safety ISO 16610-2: Hydrogen generators using fuel processing technologies — Part 2: Performance	
CA			ge	Canada abstains. In general, we do not think it is necessary at this stage to have a separate performance standard. As an example, ISO/CD 22734 standard for hydrogen generators using water electrolysis has key performance requirements incorporated together with construction and safety requirements. We think it is quite appropriate since, in our opinion, technology of plug-and-play hydrogen generators has not reached a level of maturity that would justify a separate performance standard. On the other hand, in this case we are not willing to cast a negative vote if reformer community feels strongly that a separate performance standard for fuel processing technology is needed today.		
No			ge	We will not support a splitting of ISO/CD 16110 into two parts, one for Safety and one for Performance. The reason is that the safety level of the generator must be integrated with the design and performance. The objectives of safety requirements are to give frames for and focus on the performance. The safety requirements must be reflected in the Operation Manual for safe performance. Then there should be no need for a special performance standard.		
NIL				We approve the change of scope of ISO/CD 16110.		

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10