Compilation of comments received during the circulation of ISO/TC 197 document N 310

Date: 2005-09-26	Document: ISO/TC 197 **N 315 Annex 2**

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	**Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex** (e.g. 3.1)	**Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note** (e.g. Table 1)	**Type of com-ment**[2]	**Comment (justification for change) by the MB**	**Proposed change by the MB**	**Secretariat observations** on each comment submitted
AR				Clauses on Installation and maintenance of hydrogen detectors should be included into the provisional content outlined in the Annex 2.		
AT				To N 310, Annex 2: Consider the ISO-Drafting rules and split clause 1 into clause 1 "Scope" and clause 2 "Normative References"		
CA				The proponent did not provide sufficient justification for the need for a new Hydrogen Detector standard.		
CA				IEC TC 31 has developed International Standard for Flammable Gas Detectors (IEC 61779) that has been extensively used by hydrogen and fuel cell industry for hydrogen detectors.		
CA				It is the opinion of Canada that the topic of Hydrogen Detectors should stay within the domain of IEC even if it were used only for quality assessment or certification of the detectors, as suggested by the proponent. IEC TC 31 is going to renumber the IEC 61779 standard as 60079-29. The incorporation of the flammable gas detector standard into the IEC 60079 family – Electrical Apparatus for Explosive Gas Atmospheres – is the logical place for such standard. There is no reason to develop a specific hydrogen detector standard within ISO domain. Specific hydrogen requirements (if needed) could be incorporated into the existing IEC standard via due process.		
CA				Canada does not agree with the approach suggested by the proponent to tie in the detectors into the design of hydrogen filling stations. We believe that hydrogen (flammable gas) detectors are ineffective in the open environment. More over, they might create a feeling of false safety that a hydrogen station (particularly dispensers) can be effectively protected by hydrogen sensors. From our prospective, small leaks that are undetectable by pressure drop mechanisms are likely unavoidable and likely harmless. Larger leaks are easily		

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CA for Canada; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	**Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex** (e.g. 3.1)	**Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note** (e.g. Table 1)	**Type of com-ment**[2]	**Comment (justification for change) by the MB**	**Proposed change by the MB**	**Secretariat observations** on each comment submitted
				detectable by pressure control and / or noise. Hydrogen detectors should be used only in areas where potentially hazardous accumulation of gas is feasible (confined / stagnation areas with insufficient ventilation). Measurement of very low concentrations of hydrogen at a refuelling station will only cause false alarms and disruption of its normal operation. (Note: nobody measures concentration of gasoline vapour at a gasoline refuelling station though its LFL is 3.5 times lower and diffusivity in air is 5 times lower than that of hydrogen).		
DK				Please note that Denmark find this NWI important that will note necessarily be able to participate directly in the development.		
DE				The subject is already covered by International Standard IEC 61779. H_2 eventually worth an annex to IEC 61779.		
US				Consideration should be given to revise IEC 61779 (1-6) and UL 2075 to accommodate hydrogen rather than write a new standard. Perhaps IEC TC 31 should lead this work with TC 197 members participating. In any case, there is a need for coordination with IEC TC 31 in this effort.		

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CA for Canada; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.