



ISO/TC 197
Hydrogen technologies

Email of secretary: jim.ferrero@bnq.qc.ca
Secretariat: SCC (Canada)

CIB Vote Summary and comments

Document type: Summary of voting

Date of document: 2016-02-03

Expected action: INFO

Background: Here are the results, including the comments, of the CIB concerning the designation for the publication of the DTR 19880-1.

Committee URL: <http://isotc.iso.org/livelink/livelink/open/tc197>

Result of voting

Ballot Information

Ballot reference	Resolution 399 from the 24th Plenary Meeting of TC 197
Ballot type	CIB
Ballot title	CIB to approve the publication of DTR 19880-1 as a TS
Opening date	2015-12-13
Closing date	2016-01-31
Note	<p>Please refer to document N 746 for an explanitor note concerning this ballot prepared by the TC 197 Chair and Secretary.</p> <p>P-Members are requested, if possible to post their vote by January 15th, 2016, in view of the critical pending discussions with CEN TC 268 WG 5.</p>

Member responses:

Votes cast (21)	Argentina (IRAM) Brazil (ABNT) Canada (SCC) China (SAC) Czech Republic (UNMZ) Denmark (DS) Egypt (EOS) France (AFNOR) Germany (DIN) India (BIS) Italy (UNI) Japan (JISC) Korea, Republic of (KATS) Netherlands (NEN) New Zealand (SNZ) Norway (SN) Russian Federation (GOST R) Spain (AENOR) Sweden (SIS) United Kingdom (BSI) United States (ANSI)
Comments submitted (2)	Australia (SA) Sri Lanka (SLSI)

Votes not cast (0)

Questions:	
Q.1	"Do you approve of the publication of DTR 19880-1 as a Technical Specification (TS 19880-1)?"

Votes by members	Q.1
Argentina (IRAM)	Abstain
Brazil (ABNT)	Abstain
Canada (SCC)	Approve
China (SAC)	Approve
Czech Republic (UNMZ)	Approve
Denmark (DS)	Approve
Egypt (EOS)	Abstain
France (AFNOR)	Approve
Germany (DIN)	Approve
India (BIS)	Approve
Italy (UNI)	Approve
Japan (JISC)	Approve
Korea, Republic of (KATS)	Approve
Netherlands (NEN)	Disapprove
New Zealand (SNZ)	Approve
Norway (SN)	Approve
Russian Federation (GOST R)	Approve
Spain (AENOR)	Abstain
Sweden (SIS)	Approve
United Kingdom (BSI)	Approve
United States (ANSI)	Approve

Answers to Q.1: "Do you approve of the publication of DTR 19880-1 as a Technical Specification (TS 19880-1)?"		
16 x	Approve	Canada (SCC) China (SAC) Czech Republic (UNMZ) Denmark (DS) France (AFNOR) Germany (DIN) India (BIS) Italy (UNI) Japan (JISC)

		Korea, Republic of (KATS) New Zealand (SNZ) Norway (SN) Russian Federation (GOST R) Sweden (SIS) United Kingdom (BSI) United States (ANSI)
1 x	Disapprove	Netherlands (NEN)
4 x	Abstain	Argentina (IRAM) Brazil (ABNT) Egypt (EOS) Spain (AENOR)

Comments from Voters		
Member:	Comment:	Date:
Germany (DIN)	Comment	2016-01-25 10:25:54
<p>The approval in the German standardization committee "Hydrogen technologies" was not unanimous. Objections were raised that, once a Technical Specification, ISO/TS 19880-1 could be taken up by CEN to be turned into a European standard. However, ISO/TR 19880-1 contains a number of specifications, predominantly from the U.S., as normative references which would not be acceptable as normative references on a European level. But, at the end, it is regarded permissive as long as ISO/TC 19880-1 is kept on an international level.</p>		
Netherlands (NEN)	Comment File	2016-01-29 12:25:40
CommentFiles/Resolution 399 from the 24th Plenary Meeting of TC 197_NEN.docx		

Comments from Commenters		
Member:	Comment:	Date:
Australia (SA)	Comment	2016-01-12 01:48:33
no comment		
Sri Lanka (SLSI)	Comment	2016-01-20 07:32:19
Abstain		

To the Chairman of ISO/TC 197
Dr. A. Tchouvelev

NEN

NEN Energy

P.O. Box 5059
2600 GB Delft

Vlinderweg 6
2623 AX Delft

+31 15 2 690 326
energy@nen.nl
www.nen.nl

ING NL02 INGB 0000 0253 01
Rabobank NL43 RABO 0106 8395 43

Netherlands Standardization Institute

REFERENCE
310197/NEN/Resolution 399

DATE
2016-01-29

SUBJECT
Resolution 399 from the 24th Plenary Meeting of TC 197

Dear Mister Tchouvelev,

The national mirror committee from The Netherlands, 310 197 'Waterstof en Brandstofcellen', would like to give the following formal reaction, as attachment to our vote on the CIB (Resolution 399 from the 24th Plenary Meeting of TC 197) to consider publishing DTR 19880-1 as a Technical Specification (TS) rather than as a Technical Report (TR).

The Dutch mirror committee does not approve that (the content) ISO/**TR** 19880-1 will be published as ISO/**TS** 19880-1. The national mirror committee of The Netherlands has the following arguments:

- The Dutch mirror committee based their 'initial' formal vote in favour of the Technical Report (TR) on the expectation that this document would be published accordingly as a TR (informative document) – not as a Technical Specification (TS). Notwithstanding the fact that this document could well evolve and eventually become an International Standard (normative document), the Dutch mirror committee had the expectation that before that significant improvements and elaborations would be made to the TR document. Therefore the Dutch mirror committee would at least expect a reasonable/regular comment period, in order to react on the content of the now proposed TS.
- Furthermore, the Dutch mirror committee considers the content of the current TR document as not technical sufficient for TS. Nevertheless, the Dutch mirror committee/experts will of course continue to contribute to further improvement of the content in ISO/TC 197 WG 24.
- At this moment the Dutch mirror committee cannot foresee potential (legal) consequences of transformation of the document from a TR into TS.

The Dutch mirror committee is aware that national governments need a document with (at least) TS status for reference from the European AFI Directive to their national legislation, but this committee also has to consider the quality of the standard.

With kind regards,
on behalf of the national mirror committee 310 197 'Waterstof en Brandstofcellen',



Indra te Ronde
Secretary of norm committee 310 197 'Waterstof en Brandstofcellen'
The Netherlands Standardization Institute (NEN)
Email: indra.teronde@nen.nl
T (+31) 015 2 690 406
M (+31) 06 33 342 983

NEN: Sets the standard