



ISO/TC 197
Hydrogen technologies

Email of secretary: jim.ferrero@bnq.qc.ca
Secretariat: SCC (Canada)

ISO DIS 19882 Collated Comments

Document type: Other committee document

Date of document: 2017-09-28

Expected action: INFO

Background: These are the collated comments from the DIS 19882 ballot.

Committee URL: <http://isotc.iso.org/livelink/livelink/open/tc197>

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2017-09-22

Document: DIS 19882

Project: WG 18

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
US 01 001				GE	It is sometimes difficult to distinguish where a note ends, or if the next paragraph is part of the note.	Put notes in a different font, size, indent, or other means to more clearly identify where they end.	
DE 002		01.01		Ge	In the introduction only ISO 14687 is mentioned. Is a reference of SAE J2719 necessary?	Please clarify	
US 02 003		01.01	1		"on hydrogen fuelled vehicles". These components are not for stationary storage use. Are they suitable for material handling equipment	This International Standard establishes minimum requirements for pressure relief devices intended for use on hydrogen fuelled vehicles fuel containers that comply with ISO 19881, IEC 62282-4-101, ANSI HGV 2, CSA B51 Part 2, EC79/EU406, SAE J2579, or the UN GTR No. 13 for fuel cell vehicles.	
US 03 004		01.01	2		Why link a component to a single grade of fuel? 14687-1,-2 & -3 are being merged. The current CD calls the -2 gaseous grade Type I Grade D (gaseous fuel for PEM road vehicles).	Pressure relief devices designed to comply with this International Standard are intended to be used with high quality hydrogen fuel such as fuel complying with SAE J2719 or ISO 14687-2 Type I Grade D .	
US 04 005		01.02	1		Why isn't UN GTR 13 mentioned?	Add the reference to the UN GTR 13 if allowed as normative reference; otherwise, add to Bibliography.	
US 05 006		01.02	Note 3		"yard/pound" quantities – are strange units.	Use "In-pound units" or "customary units"	
US 06 007		02		Te	Standards are continually being updated, so that specification of year of release results in not keeping up with technical changes in other standards.	Remove year of publication for at least ISO and IEC standards unless there is a specific need. If a specific requirement is needed, consider placing the requirement directly into ISO 19882.	
US 07 008		03.01			A Webster definition	Consider deletion.	
US 08 009		03.02			A Webster definition	Consider deletion.	
US 09 010		04.03			PRD MFG don't care about a bunch of system terms. They need rated pressure (> MAWT) and temperature set point. The rest adds confusion.	Rework as pressure class using terminology of GTR 13. See modified text and proposed new Table 1: 4.2 Pressure classes	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
						<p>Each type of PRD hose assemblies shall be designated according to five pressure classes, depending on the pressure used for dispensing hydrogen distinguished by each category of pressure defined in Clause 3 as shown in Table 1.</p>  <p>TC 197 U.S. Proposed New Table</p>	
US 10 011		04.04	Note		Where is MDP defined?	Delete the word “developed”.	
DE 012		06.01		Ge	In ANSI HPRD 1-2013 a paragraph regarding documentation of the material suitability is given? Was this paragraph deliberately omitted? What is the reason?	Please clarify	
US 11 013		06.01	pp after note 2		<p>What does this mean?</p> <p>Just because a material is in contact with H2 does make it compatible.</p> <p>H2 release due to high permeability, and explosive decompression due to pressure cycling may be of concern. Mismatches in coefficients of thermal expansion over the -40 to 85 C range may be an issue.</p>	<p>Non-metallic materials normally in contact with hydrogen shall be approved or verified determined to be acceptable in hydrogen service.</p> <p>Consideration shall be given to the fact that hydrogen diffuses through these materials much easier than through metals, therefore the suitability of materials shall be verified.</p>	
US 12 014		06.02	note		Anything that adversely impacts the robustness of the design is an issue	The pressure relief device shall should be designed to address prevent degradation of function from creep or plastic deformation. The design or manufacturing process should account for the effects that material defects, particularly casting and shrinkage voids, may have in decreasing the resistance to the failure modes that adversely impact the robustness of the design.	
US 13 015		06.03			clarity	The flow capacity shall be indicated in the manufacturers published literature and verified by	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2017-09-22	Document: DIS 19882	Project: WG 18
-----------------	---------------------	----------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
						the flow capacity test under 7.13. The flow capacity shall be determined by the flow capacity test under Clause 7.13 and published by the manufacturer	
US 14 016		06.04			How do you retest a fusible link?	New pressure relief devices that are found to be non-compliant with this International Standard may be reworked or repaired as long as they comply with all requirements, and are retested, as required, to confirm that they satisfy the requirements of this International Standard.	
DE 017		07.01		Ed	No line break between number and unit	Please correct	
NZ 018		07.01		te	The tolerance for pressures of 2 MPa or less of +0/-1 MPa seems high. i.e. a 50% reduction is permissible.	As there are relatively few pressures stated in the text delete the words: <i>“Unless stated otherwise, the tests specified herein shall be conducted with the following tolerances on specified pressures: Pressures 2 MPa or less: +0 / -1 MPa Pressures 125% NWP or greater: +2 MPa / -0 MPa”</i> Specify tolerances for all individual pressures in the text.	
CA 019		07.01	9	te	Hydrogen used for testing shall comply with SAE J2719 or ISO 14687-2 In many tests in the document it does not specify what medium should be used for the tests.	Unless otherwise specified all tests in this document shall be performed with hydrogen that shall comply with SAE J2719 or ISO 14687-2	
US 16 020		07.01	Last line		See comments on clause 1.1 pp 2	Hydrogen used for testing shall comply with SAE J2719 or ISO 14687-2 be high quality hydrogen fuel such as fuel complying with SAE J2719 or ISO 14687-2 Type I Grade D.	
US 15 021		07.01	new		Need a temperature test tolerance	Unless stated otherwise, the tests specified herein shall be conducted with the following tolerances on specified <u>temperatures ± 5 °C.</u>	
DE		07.02.2	Table 2	Te	Please provide rationale for the 2750 pressure	Please harmonize standards	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2017-09-22

Document: DIS 19882

Project: WG 18

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
022					cycles at a sample temperature not more than -40°C. Pressure cycling conditions should be harmonized with ANSI HPRD 1-2013 in order to prevent additional testing		
CA 023		07.03		te	Include a provision for long trigger devices.	The longest and shortest for each design type for long trigger devices shall be tested.	
US 17 024		07.03.1		Ed	Making the requirements into a bulleted list would improve understanding	a) Five finished pressure... b) Three pressure relief...	
CA 025		07.03.1	1 & 2	te	Clarify if the same components are to be used for the 500 hour test and then for the 10 hour test or should new samples be used.	Clarify and consider splitting the test into two distinct parts.	
US 18 026		07.03.2		Te	The equation in this section is technically incorrect. While it may give reasonable answers, the units don't balance, indicating short-cuts were taken. That is, the units on the left side are °C to the first power, and the units on the right side are °C to the 0.503 power. This is something like saying the volume of a region is equal to the length to the 1.2 power.	Put a technically correct equation into this section. Note that the equation in the original CSA PRD1 was correct and appropriate for determining the 10-hour test temperature (noting that PRD1 used 1 year at 82°C, vs. this document using 3 years at 85°C) (also note that this equation works regardless of using C, K, F, or R): 7.5.3 Long-Term Test Temperature. It is assumed that time-to-activation of fusible alloys is a rate process governed by the power law relationship of the form: $t = A T^B$ where T is temperature t is the time to activation A and B are constants which depend upon fusible alloy and pressure relief device design The calculated time-to-activation for pressure relief devices must be greater than 1 year at	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2017-09-22	Document: DIS 19882	Project: WG 18
-----------------	---------------------	----------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
						+82°C (+180°F) and at least 20 years at +57°C (+135°F). Device assemblies must exceed 500 hours at their long-term test temperature. Mathematical manipulation results in the following requirement for long-term test temperature: $T_L = T (0.057)^{(0.34(\log(T/T_f))}$ where T_L is the long-term test temperature, °C (°F) T_f is the fusible material melt temperature, °C (°F) T is +82°C (+180°F) log is base 10	
CA 027		07.03.2	1	ed	Pressure cycling shall be performed – Wrong test is being referenced.	“Accelerated life test shall be performed...	
CA 028		07.03.2	2	ed	..., each pressure connection should include a check valve to prevent pressure depletion of the system when one specimen fails.	...”, each pressure connection should include a check valve to prevent pressure depletion of the system should one specimen fails.”	
US 19 029		07.03.3		Ed	It would be clearer if the criteria were bulleted, and clarified that it is “the” 5 and 3, rather than “any” 5 and 3.	a) The five pressure relief devices ... b) The three pressure relief devices...	
CA 030		07.03.3	1	te	Clarify if a leakage rate is allowed. If so, the leak rate shall not exceed 10 Ncc/hour	Five pressure relief devices tested at their accelerated life test temperature shall not activate in less than 500 hours. The TPRDs shall not have a leakage rate that exceeds 10 Ncc/hour.	
US 20 031		07.03.3	2		Average car fire is 20 min to 1 hr. At 10 hrs, no point in having a TPRD. A note is needed here to explain the 10-hour value.	NOTE—The 10-hour time is to confirm conformance for the basis for the equation in 7.3.2 [equations should be numbered for cross referencing].	
DE		07.05.3		Te	“The tested samples shall then be subjected to	Delete 7.12:	

1 MB = Member body / NC = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2017-09-22

Document: DIS 19882

Project: WG 18

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
032					Clause 7.10, 7.11 and 7.12.” Necessity to perform Flow Capacity Test (7.12) on test sample is not comprehensible.	“The tested samples shall then be subjected to Clause 7.10 and 7.11.”	
US 21 033		07.06.2		Te	The fluids chosen originally were not intended to be “specific”, rather they are representative of “worst case” selections, with reasonable likelihood of exposure, from different chemical classes. It is possible for PRDs to be exposed to the chemical classes represented by sodium hydroxide and ammonium nitrate. Specifically, car wash and bus wash cleaning solutions have a pH that is basic, and would be represented by the sodium hydroxide.	Add exposure to sodium hydroxide and ammonium nitrate. Adjust coverage in B.1.5 accordingly	
US 22 034		07.08			Testing is only copper based alloys in contact with ammonia (season cracking). Where is the test for stainless steel in contact with halides (halide attack)?	Add testing with halides to address halide attack of stainless steel.	
CA 035		07.09.1.2		te	There is a need to clarify how the TPRDs are to be dropped. In their pre-assembled mode or after the assembly. If the TPRD is made up of many different components, should all the parts be dropped & should they be assembled or not.	Clarify how the TPRDs are to be dropped.	
US 23 036		07.09.1.3		Te	The criteria for acceptance are a bit subjective. Rather than making a visual assessment, why not subject the PRD to burst, cycle, and/or benchtop activation?	Change criteria to cycle XXX times, followed by benchtop activation test.	
DE 037		07.09.2.2		Te	Please provide rationale for the 40 Hz test frequency. ANSI HPRD 1-2013 requires a test frequency of 500 Hz. Frequency should be harmonized in order to prevent additional testing	Please harmonize standards	
CA 038		07.10.02	4	te	The text reads that the component is conditioned to -40C. It does not mention for how long.	The component shall be conditioned to -40C or lower until thermal stability is attained.	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2017-09-22

Document: DIS 19882

Project: WG 18

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
CA 039		07.10.02	4	te	The text says that it pressurized at both 100 percent and 5 percent of NWP. This leaves it up to the testing agency of which one they test first.	It should read “.. and pressurized at 100 percent and then at 5 percent of NWP”	
CA 040		07.10.02	5	te	The text says that it pressurized at both 5 percent and 150 percent of NWP. This leaves it up to the testing agency of which one they test first.	It should read “.. and pressurized at 5 percent and then at 150 percent of NWP”	
CA 041		07.10.02	5	te	Conditioning at room temperature does not mention for how long.	Specify “until thermal stability is attained”.	
CA 042		07.10.02	6	te	The text says that it pressurized at both 5 percent and 150 percent of NWP. This leaves it up to the testing agency of which one they test first.	It should read “.. and pressurized at 5 percent and then at 150 percent of NWP”	
CA 043		07.10.02	6	te	Conditioning at 85C or higher does not mention for how.	Specify “until thermal stability is attained”.	
US 24 044		07.11		ge	What is the criteria or how is the result recorded for this test?	WG is asked to consider adding the range of activation times to 7.11.3.	
DE 045		07.11.02		Te	The specified air surrounding temperature is different compared to ANSI HPRD 1-2013 chapter 7.11.2: ISO 19882:2017: 600°C ± 10°C ANSI HPRD 1-2013: 593°C ± 11°C This results in a temperature corridor of only 14°C	Please harmonize standards	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2017-09-22

Document: DIS 19882

Project: WG 18

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
					(590°C...604°C) to achieve the requirements of ISO and HPRD 1. To avoid unnecessary testing the temperature ranges of both standards should be harmonized with a tolerance of at least ±10°C		
CA 046		07.12.02	4	te	Add flow rate shall be recorded	The inlet temperature, pressure and flow rate shall be recorded.	
DE 047		07.13.02		Te	Same comment as for clause 7.11.2	Please harmonize standards	
DE 048		08.04		Te	According to our knowledge the leak test at higher pressure is more critical. Therefore the leakage should be tested at a minimum of 125 percent of manufacturer's specified NWP and not at both 5 percent and 125 percent. Limit the test effort to the necessary.	Please delete one pressure level and keep the more critical pressure level	
US 25 049		09.04.2			Clarify wording of the requirement.	The pressure relief device shall be immersed in a liquid bath that is maintained at a temperature from 0°C to 5.6°C 5.6°C -0°C lower than the manufacturer's specified activation temperature. The pressure relief device shall be pressurized to 1.38 MPa. The temperature and pressure shall be maintained for at least 24 hours. The pressure relief device shall not activate within this time.	
NZ 050		09.04.2		te	A tolerance for the quoted pressure of 1.38 MPa should be specified to avoid application of 7.1 that has default tolerance for pressures of 2 MPa or less of +0/-1 MPa. If no tolerance is specified a test pressure of 0.38 MPa will be acceptable.	The pressure relief device shall be pressurized to 1.38 MPa +/- ??.	
US 26 051		09.04.3		Ed	"Must" in not standard wording, change to "shall" in the last sentnce.	The pressure relief device must <u>shall</u> activate...	
US 27		09.04.3			Clarify wording of the requirement.	The temperature of the fluid bath shall be increased	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2017-09-22

Document: DIS 19882

Project: WG 18

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
052						to a level from 0°C to 5.6°C 5.6°C + 0°C higher than the manufacturers specified activation temperature. The pressure relief device must activate within four hours of reaching the target temperature range.	
DE 053		09.05		Te	Production of TPRDs is a well-established process without effect on pressure cycling stability. If FMEA identifies critical components regarding pressure cycling a pressure cycle verification is acceptable but a general need for batch pressure cycle verification is not comprehensible. Therefore the chapter should be deleted.	Delete chapters 9.5, 9.5.1, 9.5.2 and 9.5.3	
US 28 054		10.01			Clarify wording of the requirement.	Pressure relief devices shall be marked with the name and year of this International Standard (ISO 19882), type of gas (H2), the manufacturer's specified nominal working pressure or pressure class (H25, H35, etc.), the manufacturer's identification, part number, and traceability code.	
US 29 055		A.1			The TPRD is installed at the vessel manufacturer not at the TPRD manufacturer.	The purpose of this informative annex is to recognize that proper operation of the TPRD(s) for protection of the fuel container, fuel storage subsystem, and vehicle level requirements. While the installation of the TPRD(s) is beyond of the scope of this document, system integrators should be advised of this information. One possibility is by inclusion of appropriate notes in the manufacturer's literature under Clause 11.	
** 056		General		ed	Please use the simple template as a model for the format and structure as well as the model texts for this document. Simple template: https://www.iso.org/drafting-standards.html		
** 057		General		Ed	1.2 does not belong in the Scope. See the comments made directly on the text.		

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2017-09-22

Document: DIS 19882

Project: WG 18

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
** 058		General: conformity assessment issue		ed	The CASCO conformity assessment department at ISO/CS is reviewing the document for conformity assessment issues. We will send you their review and comments as soon as we receive them and it may entail some redrafting of the following clauses: Clause 5 quality assurance 7.1 design qualification testing Clause 8 inspection and acceptance testing Clause 9 product batch testing A.1		

D:\ISO\data\prod_iso_comment-collation\work\temp\ISO_DIS 19882_ANSI.doc: Collation successful

D:\ISO\data\prod_iso_comment-collation\work\temp\ISO_DIS 19882_DIN.doc: Collation successful

D:\ISO\data\prod_iso_comment-collation\work\temp\ISO_DIS 19882_ISO.doc: Collation successful

D:\ISO\data\prod_iso_comment-collation\work\temp\ISO_DIS 19882_NZSO.doc: Collation successful

D:\ISO\data\prod_iso_comment-collation\work\temp\ISO_DIS 19882_SCC.doc: Collation successful

Collation of files was successful. Number of collated files: 5

SELECTED (number of files): 5

PASSED TEST (number of files): 5

FAILED TEST (number of files): 0

CCT - Version 4.0/2015

¹ **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

² **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2017-09-22

Document: DIS 19882

Project: WG 18

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
------------------------	----------------	----------------------	----------------------------	---------------------------------	----------	-----------------	------------------------------------

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial